

Solutions to Translation Puzzles pp212-213

$\sim \exists c: \exists b: (2b = c)$ **TRUE**

I found it useful to translate $\exists b: (2b = c)$ (leaving c as a free variable) before I started to worry about the second quantifier. Proceeding directly, this says “There exists a number b such that two times $b = c$.” Thinking about the meaning of this phrase, I arrive at “ c is a multiple of 2”, or simply “ c is even”. Then the entire expression becomes $\sim \exists c: c \text{ is even}$ and direct translation gives “It is not the case that every number c is even”, or simply “Not all numbers are even”. This is certainly true.

$\exists c: \sim \exists b: (2b = c)$ **FALSE**

Starting again with $\exists b: (2b = c)$ as “ c is even”, handling the negation as “It is not the case that c is even” or “ c is odd”, and then proceeding with the universal quantifier, I arrive at “Every number c is odd” or “All numbers are odd”. This is false.

$\forall c: \exists b: \sim (2b = c)$ **TRUE**

I’m most comfortable with $\sim (2b = c)$ as “ $2b \neq c$ ”. Then, working to the left, I see “There exists a b such that $2b \neq c$ ” and I handle the second quantifier as “For every number c there is a number b such that $2b \neq c$ ” or “Given the number c , I can find a number b that forces the inequality $2b \neq c$ ”. This is true even when c is even; for example, take b to be 1 if c is not 2, and take b to be 2 if c is 2.

$\sim \exists b: \forall c: (2b = c)$ **TRUE**

I find it useful again to start on the left. I understand $\forall c: (2b = c)$ as “For every number c , $2b = c$ ”. Then the entire sentence becomes “It is not the case that there exists a number b with the property that for every number c , $2b = c$ ” or, if you like, “There is no single number b for which the equation $2b = c$ holds for every c ”. This is true.

$\exists b: \sim \forall c: (2b = c)$ **TRUE**

This one’s tough because of where the negation sits. My ear likes the negation expressed as “It’s not true that $2b = c$ holds for every c ”. This helps me to avoid the mistranslation “For every c , $2b \neq c$ ”.

Well, it is almost certainly true that the statement " $2b=c$ holds for every c " is false, so that our $\sim \forall c: (2b=c)$ is almost certainly true, no matter what b we choose to work with.

Let me be specific. "There exists a number b such that the statement " $2b=c$ holds for every c " is not true". With $b=10$, for example, the equality $2b=c$ only holds for $c=20$ and not for every c .

In fact, you can make a stronger true statement: " $\exists b: \sim \forall c: (2b=c)$ ", because for any b you choose, $2b=c$ will only hold for one value of c and not for every c .

$\exists b: \forall c: \sim (2b=c)$ **FALSE**

While the last expression had us working with "it is not the case that equality holds for every c ", this one has us consider "it is the case that inequality holds for every c ". Thus the statement is "There exists a number b such that no matter what number c you choose $2b \neq c$ ". This is false: given $b=10$, for example, choose $c=20$ causing the inequality to fail.